

This is the supplementary material for the paper: “Fast learning in reproducing kernel Kreĭn spaces via generalized measures”, by Fanghui Liu, Xiaolin Huang, Yingyi Chen, and Johan A.K. Suykens. The supplementary material (Appendix) is organized as follows.

- Section A gives the proof of Theorem 3 on the studied open question.
- The approximation performance is theoretically demonstrated in Section B in terms of uniform approximation error bound and variance reduction.
- In Section (C), we demonstrate that polynomial kernels on the unit sphere by ℓ_2 normalization data is with finite total mass.
- Section D gives the proof of Theorem 4.
- The measure of arc-cosine kernels on the unit sphere by ℓ_2 normalization data is given in Section E.

A Proof of Theorem 3

Proof. We give the proof of the existence.

(i) Necessity.

An stationary indefinite kernel associated with RKKS admits the positive decomposition

$$k(\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}') = k_+(\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}') - k_-(\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}'), \quad \forall \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}' \in X,$$

where k_+ and k_- are two positive definite kernels. According to the Bochner’s theorem [21], there exists two probability measures μ_+, μ_- such that

$$k(\mathbf{z}) = k_+(\mathbf{z}) - k_-(\mathbf{z}) = \int_{\Omega} \exp(i\boldsymbol{\omega}^\top \mathbf{z}) \mu_+(d\boldsymbol{\omega}) - \int_{\Omega} \exp(i\boldsymbol{\omega}^\top \mathbf{z}) \mu_-(d\boldsymbol{\omega}),$$

where $\mathbf{z} := \mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}'$. Denote $\mu := \mu_+ - \mu_-$, it is clear that μ is a signed measure, and its total mass is finite because of $\|\mu\| = \|\mu_+\| + \|\mu_-\| = 2$.

(ii) Sufficiency.

Let $\Omega := \mathbb{R}^d$ and \mathcal{A} be the smallest σ -algebra containing all open subsets of Ω , and $\mu : \mathcal{A} \rightarrow [-\infty, \infty]$

$$\mu(\boldsymbol{\omega}) = \int_{\Omega} \exp(-i\boldsymbol{\omega}^\top \mathbf{z}) k(\mathbf{z}) d\mathbf{z}.$$

Since we assume that μ has total mass $\|\mu\| < \infty$, i.e., μ is finite, μ can be regarded as a signed measure. By virtue of Jordan decomposition in Theorem 2, there exist two nonnegative finite measures μ_+ and μ_- such that $\mu = \mu_+ - \mu_-$. One intuitive implementation way is choosing $\mu_+ = \max\{\mu, 0\}$ and $\mu_- = \min\{0, \mu\}$. Then using the inverse Fourier transform and Plancherel’s theorem [52], we have

$$\begin{aligned} k(\mathbf{z}) &= \int_{\Omega} \exp(i\boldsymbol{\omega}^\top \mathbf{z}) \mu(d\boldsymbol{\omega}) = \int_{\Omega} \exp(i\boldsymbol{\omega}^\top \mathbf{z}) \mu_+(d\boldsymbol{\omega}) - \int_{\Omega} \exp(i\boldsymbol{\omega}^\top \mathbf{z}) \mu_-(d\boldsymbol{\omega}) \\ &= \|\mu_+\| \int_{\Omega} \exp(i\boldsymbol{\omega}^\top \mathbf{z}) \tilde{\mu}_+(d\boldsymbol{\omega}) - \|\mu_-\| \int_{\Omega} \exp(i\boldsymbol{\omega}^\top \mathbf{z}) \tilde{\mu}_-(d\boldsymbol{\omega}) \\ &= \|\mu_+\| \tilde{k}_+(\mathbf{z}) - \|\mu_-\| \tilde{k}_-(\mathbf{z}), \end{aligned}$$

where $\tilde{\mu}_+ := \mu_+ / \|\mu_+\|$ and $\tilde{\mu}_- := \mu_- / \|\mu_-\|$ are two nonnegative Borel measures, which correspond to two positive definite kernels \tilde{k}_+ and \tilde{k}_- , respectively. By defining $k_+ := \|\mu_+\| \tilde{k}_+$ and $k_- := \|\mu_-\| \tilde{k}_-$, we have

$$k(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') = k_+(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') - k_-(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}'), \quad \forall \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}' \in X.$$

This completes the proof.

Based on the above analysis, we give a characterization of the RKHSs \mathcal{H}_{\pm} through the given spectral density μ_{\pm} . In [63], a RKHS can be characterized by its measure via Fourier transform. Therefore, in our model, the RKHSs \mathcal{H}_{\pm} are represented by μ_{\pm} . That is, for any $f \in \mathcal{H}_{\pm}$, the inner product is induced by the Hilbert norm

$$\|f\|_{\mathcal{H}_{\pm}}^2 = \int_{\mathbb{R}^d} \frac{|F(\boldsymbol{\omega})|^2}{\mu_+(\boldsymbol{\omega})} d\boldsymbol{\omega},$$

C.2 A large ω

Consider the asymptotic behavior for large ω . The Bessel function of the first kind is asymptotically equivalent to

$$J_\alpha(x) \sim \sqrt{\frac{2}{\pi x}} \cos\left(x - \frac{\pi\alpha}{2} - \frac{\pi}{4}\right), \text{ when } x \gg \left|\alpha^2 - \frac{1}{4}\right|.$$

The Fourier transform of the polynomial kernel on the sphere, i.e., the measure μ , is hence given by [8]

$$\mu(\omega) \sim \frac{1}{\sqrt{\pi\omega}} \left(1 - \frac{4}{a^2}\right)^p \left(\frac{2}{\omega}\right)^{d/2} \cos\left((d+1)\frac{\pi}{4} - 2\omega\right), \text{ for a large } \omega. \quad (6)$$

In this way, we have $\int_{c_2}^\infty |\mu(\omega)| d\omega < \infty$ for a large ω , where c is some constant satisfying $c_2 \gg \frac{1}{4}|d^2 - 1|$.

Accordingly, combining Eq. (6) with Eq. (5), we conclude that

$$\|\mu\| := \int_0^\infty |\mu(\omega)| d\omega = \int_0^{c_1} |\mu(\omega)| d\omega + \int_{c_1}^{c_2} |\mu(\omega)| d\omega + \int_{c_2}^\infty |\mu(\omega)| d\omega < \infty,$$

where we use $\int_{c_1}^{c_2} |\mu(\omega)| d\omega$ is finite due to the continuous, bounded Bessel function $J_\alpha(x)$ on a finite region $[c_1, c_2]$.

D Proof of Theorem 4

To prove Theorem 4, we firstly derive its formulation on the unit sphere and then demonstrate that it is a shift-invariant but not positive definite kernel via *completely monotone* functions.

Definition 3. (Completely monotone [64]) A function f is called *completely monotone* on $(0, +\infty)$ if it satisfies $f \in C^\infty(0, +\infty)$ and

$$(-1)^r f^{(r)}(x) \geq 0,$$

for all $r = 0, 1, 2, \dots$ and all $x > 0$. Moreover, f is called *completely monotone* on $[0, +\infty)$ if it is additionally defined in $C[0, +\infty)$.

Note that the definition of completely monotone functions can be also restricted to a finite interval, i.e., f is completely monotone on $[a, b] \subset \mathbb{R}$, see in [8].

Besides, we need the following lemma that demonstrates the connection between positive definite and completely monotone functions for the proof.

Lemma 1. (Schoenberg's theorem [64]) A function f is completely monotone on $[0, +\infty)$ if and only if $f := g(\|\cdot\|_2^2)$ is radial and positive definite function on all \mathbb{R}^d for every d .

Now let us prove Theorem 4.

Proof. By virtue of $\langle \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}' \rangle = 1 - \frac{1}{2}\|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}'\|_2^2$ and $\|\mathbf{x}\|_2 = \|\mathbf{x}'\|_2 = 1$, we have $\|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}'\|_2 \in [0, 2]$. Therefore, the standard NTK of a two-layer ReLU network can be formulated as

$$\begin{aligned} k(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') &= \langle \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}' \rangle \kappa_0(\langle \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}' \rangle) + \kappa_1(\langle \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}' \rangle) \\ &= \left(1 - \frac{1}{2}\|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}'\|_2^2\right) \kappa_0\left(1 - \frac{1}{2}\|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}'\|_2^2\right) + \kappa_1\left(1 - \frac{1}{2}\|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}'\|_2^2\right) \\ &= \frac{2 - \|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}'\|_2^2}{\pi} \arccos\left(\frac{1}{2}\|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}'\|_2^2 - 1\right) + \frac{\|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}'\|_2}{2\pi} \sqrt{4 - \|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}'\|_2^2} \\ &= \frac{2 - z^2}{\pi} \arccos\left(\frac{1}{2}z^2 - 1\right) + \frac{z}{2\pi} \sqrt{4 - z^2}, z := \|\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}'\|_2 \in [0, 2], \end{aligned}$$

which is shift-invariant.

Next, we prove that $k(z)$ is not a positive definite kernel, i.e., $g(\sqrt{z}) := k(z)$ is not a completely monotone function over $[0, \infty)$ by Lemma 1. In other words, there exist some value $x \in [0, \infty)$ such that $(-1)^l g^{(l)}(x) < 0$ for some l . To this end, the function g is given by

$$g(x) = \frac{2 - x}{\pi} \arccos\left(\frac{1}{2}x - 1\right) + \frac{1}{2\pi} \sqrt{4x - x^2}, x \in [0, 4],$$

and its first-order derivative is

$$g'(x) = \frac{4-2x}{4\pi\sqrt{4x-x^2}} - \frac{2-x}{2\pi\sqrt{1-(\frac{x}{2}-1)^2}} - \frac{\arccos(\frac{x}{2}-1)}{\pi}.$$

Since $g'(x)$ is continuous, and $\lim_{x \rightarrow 0} g'(x) = -\infty$ and $\lim_{x \rightarrow 4} g'(x) = \infty$, there exists a constant c such that $g'(x) < 0$ over $(0, c)$ and $g'(x) > 0$ over $(c, 4)$. That is to say, $(-1)^l g^{(l)}(x) < 0$ holds for $x \in (c, 4)$, which violates the definition of completely monotone functions. In this regard, $g(\sqrt{z}) := k(z)$ is not a completely monotone function over $[0, \infty)$ and thus $\{k(z), z \in [0, 2]; 0, z > 2\}$ is not positive definite. \square

E The measure of arc-cosine kernels on the unit sphere

According to Appendix D, the zero/first-order arc-cosine kernel on the unit sphere is proven to be stationary but indefinite. In this section, we derive its measure μ .

E.1 The measure of the zero-order arc-cosine kernel

In this section, we derive the measure μ of the zero-order arc-cosine kernel on the unit sphere.

Proposition 3. *The measure μ of the zero-order arc-cosine kernel on the unit sphere: $\kappa_0(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') := \kappa_0(z) = \frac{1}{\pi} \arccos(\frac{1}{2}z^2 - 1)$ is given by*

$$\mu(\omega) = \left(\frac{1}{\omega}\right)\left(\frac{2}{\omega}\right)^{\frac{d}{2}-1} J_{\frac{d}{2}}(2\omega) - \frac{1}{\pi}\left(\frac{1}{\omega}\right)^{\frac{d}{2}-2} \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \frac{(2j)!}{4^j(j!)^2(2j+1)} \int_0^2 \left(\frac{1}{2}z^2 - 1\right)^{2j+1} \omega z^{d/2} J_{d/2-1}(z\omega) dz,$$

where the integral $\int_0^2 (\frac{1}{2}z^2 - 1)^{2j+1} \omega z^{d/2} J_{d/2-1}(z\omega) dz$ can be computed by parts with the following simple recurrence formula

$$\int z^a J_{v+1}(z) dz = 2v \int z^{a-1} J_v(z) dz - \int z^a J_{v-1}(z) dz. \quad (7)$$

Proof. According to the definition of $\kappa_0(z)$, we have

$$\mu(\omega) = \int_0^2 \frac{z}{\pi} \arccos\left(\frac{1}{2}z^2 - 1\right) (z/\omega)^{d/2-1} J_{d/2-1}(z\omega) dz, \quad (8)$$

where $\kappa_0(\mathbf{z})$ is a radial function, i.e., $\kappa_0(\mathbf{z}) = \kappa_0(z)$ with $z := \|\mathbf{z}\|_2$, and thus its Fourier transform is also a radial function, i.e., $\mu(\omega) = \mu(\boldsymbol{\omega})$ with $\boldsymbol{\omega} := \|\boldsymbol{\omega}\|_2$. Obviously, the integrand in Eq. (8) and the integration region are both bounded, and thus we have $\mu(\omega) < \infty$. Following the proof of $\|\mu\| < \infty$ for polynomial kernels on the unit sphere in Section C, we can also demonstrate that $\|\mu\| < \infty$ for the zero-order arc-cosine kernel on the unit sphere.

To compute the integration in Eq. (8), we take the Taylor expansion of $\arccos(\frac{1}{2}z^2 - 1)$ with t terms

$$\arccos\left(\frac{1}{2}z^2 - 1\right) = \frac{\pi}{2} - \sum_{j=0}^t \frac{(2j)!}{4^j(j!)^2(2j+1)} \left(\frac{1}{2}z^2 - 1\right)^{2j+1},$$

and thus the integration in Eq. (8) can be integrated by each term regarding to Bessel functions. Moreover, by virtue of $\frac{dz^v J_v(z\omega)}{dz} = \omega z^v J_{v-1}(z\omega)$, the above integral can be computed by parts

$$\begin{aligned} \mu(\omega) &= \int_0^2 \frac{z}{\pi} \arccos\left(\frac{1}{2}z^2 - 1\right) (z/\omega)^{d/2-1} J_{d/2-1}(z\omega) dz \\ &= \frac{1}{2}\left(\frac{1}{\omega}\right)^{\frac{d}{2}-2} \int_0^2 \omega z^{\frac{d}{2}} J_{\frac{d}{2}-1}(z\omega) dz - \frac{1}{\pi}\left(\frac{1}{\omega}\right)^{\frac{d}{2}-2} \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \frac{(2j)!}{4^j(j!)^2(2j+1)} \int_0^2 \left(\frac{1}{2}z^2 - 1\right)^{2j+1} \omega z^{d/2} J_{d/2-1}(z\omega) dz, \end{aligned} \quad (9)$$

where the first term equals to $(\frac{1}{\omega})(\frac{2}{\omega})^{\frac{d}{2}-1} J_{\frac{d}{2}}(2\omega)$. Accordingly, we can conclude our proof. \square

It appears non-trivial to prove $\|\mu\| < \infty$ as Eq. (9) is quite complex. Here we choose $j = 0$ in Eq. (9) as an example, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \int_0^2 \left(\frac{1}{2}z^2 - 1 \right) \omega z^{d/2} J_{d/2-1}(z\omega) dz &= 2^{\frac{d}{2}} J_{\frac{d}{2}}(2\omega) - \int_0^2 z^{\frac{d}{2}+1} J_{\frac{d}{2}}(z\omega) \left(\frac{1}{2}z^2 - 1 \right) dz \\ &= 2^{\frac{d}{2}} J_{\frac{d}{2}}(2\omega) + \frac{1}{\omega} J_{\frac{d}{2}+1}(2\omega) - \frac{1}{2} \int_0^2 z^{\frac{d}{2}+3} J_{\frac{d}{2}}(z\omega) dz, \end{aligned} \quad (10)$$

where $\int_0^2 z^{\frac{d}{2}+3} J_{\frac{d}{2}}(z\omega) dz$ can be computed by parts

$$\int_0^2 z^{\frac{d}{2}+3} J_{\frac{d}{2}}(z\omega) dz = 2^{\frac{d}{2}+3} J_{\frac{d}{2}}(2\omega) - \frac{1}{\omega^2} 2^{\frac{d}{2}+2} J_{\frac{d}{2}+2}(2\omega). \quad (11)$$

Incorporating Eqs. (11), (10) into Eq. (9), we have

$$\mu(\omega) = \left(\frac{1}{\omega} \right) \left(\frac{2}{\omega} \right)^{\frac{d}{2}-1} J_{\frac{d}{2}}(2\omega) - \frac{1}{\pi} \left(\frac{1}{\omega} \right)^{\frac{d}{2}-2} \left[(-3) 2^{\frac{d}{2}} J_{\frac{d}{2}}(2\omega) + \frac{1}{\omega} J_{\frac{d}{2}+1}(2\omega) + \frac{1}{\omega^2} 2^{\frac{d}{2}+1} J_{\frac{d}{2}+2}(2\omega) \right].$$

Following with the proof in Section C, we can demonstrate $\|\mu\| < \infty$ by the asymptotic equivalence of Bessel functions. Accordingly, in this case, μ can be decomposed into two nonnegative measures with $\mu(\omega) = \mu_+(\omega) - \mu_-(\omega)$, where $\mu_+(\omega) = \max\{0, \mu(\omega)\}$ and $\mu_-(\omega) = \max\{0, -\mu(\omega)\}$. As a consequence, Algorithm 1 is also suitable for this kernel.

E.2 the first-order arc-cosine kernel

In this subsection, we derive the measure μ of the zero-order arc-cosine kernel admitting $\kappa_1(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') = \frac{z}{2\pi} \sqrt{4 - z^2}$.

Proposition 4. *The measure μ of the zero-order arc-cosine kernel on the unit sphere: $\kappa_0(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') := \kappa_1(z) = \frac{z}{2\pi} \sqrt{4 - z^2}$ is given by*

$$\mu(\omega) = \left(\frac{1}{\omega} \right) \left(\frac{2}{\omega} \right)^{\frac{d}{2}-1} J_{\frac{d}{2}}(2\omega) - \frac{1}{\pi} \left(\frac{1}{\omega} \right)^{\frac{d}{2}-2} \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \frac{(2j)!}{4^j (j!)^2 (2j+1)} \int_0^2 \left(\frac{1}{2}z^2 - 1 \right)^{2j+1} \omega z^{d/2} J_{d/2-1}(z\omega) dz,$$

where the integral $\int_0^2 \left(\frac{1}{2}z^2 - 1 \right)^{2j+1} \omega z^{d/2} J_{d/2-1}(z\omega) dz$ can be computed by parts with the following simple recurrence formula (7).

Proof. By fractional binomial theorem, we have

$$\binom{1/2}{j} = (-1)^{k-1} \frac{1}{2(2j-1)} \frac{(2j)!}{(2 \cdot 4 \cdot \dots \cdot (2j))^2} = \frac{-1}{2(2j-1)} \left(-\frac{1}{4} \right)^j \binom{2j}{j}.$$

Then, according to the definition of $\kappa_1(z)$, we have

$$\sqrt{4 - z^2} = 2 \left(1 - \frac{z^2}{4} \right)^{\frac{1}{2}} = 2 \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \binom{1/2}{j} \left(-\frac{z^2}{4} \right)^j = \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \frac{-1}{2j-1} \binom{2j}{j} \left(\frac{z}{4} \right)^{2j}.$$

Therefore, the measure μ of κ_1 is

$$\begin{aligned} \mu(\omega) &= \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^2 z^2 \sqrt{4 - z^2} (z/\omega)^{d/2-1} J_{d/2-1}(z\omega) dz \\ &= \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^2 z^2 (z/\omega)^{d/2-1} J_{d/2-1}(z\omega) \sum_{j=0}^{\infty} \frac{-1}{2j-1} \binom{2j}{j} \left(\frac{z}{4} \right)^{2j} dz. \end{aligned} \quad (12)$$

Accordingly, the above equation needs to compute the following integral

$$\int_0^2 z^{\frac{d}{2}+1+2j} J_{\frac{d}{2}-1}(z\omega) dz,$$

which can be computed by Eq. (7). □

Similarly, it appears non-trivial to prove $\|\mu\| < \infty$ as Eq. (12) is quite complex. Here we choose $j = 0$ in Eq. (12) as an example, we have

$$\mu(\omega) = \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^2 z^2 (z/\omega)^{d/2-1} J_{d/2-1}(z\omega) dz = \frac{\sqrt{2}-1}{2\pi} \left(\frac{1}{\omega}\right)^{\frac{d}{2}-2} 2^{\frac{d}{2}} J_{\frac{d}{2}}(2\omega).$$

In this case, it is clear that $\|\mu\| < \infty$ and thus Algorithm 1 is also suitable for this kernel.