

## SUPPLEMENTARY MATERIAL

**Proof of Lemma 1.** For any  $u_t \in \mathcal{X}$ , it holds that

$$\langle x_t - u_t, \nabla_t \rangle = \langle x_t - \hat{x}_t, \nabla_t - M_t \rangle + \langle x_t - \hat{x}_t, M_t \rangle + \langle \hat{x}_t - u_t, \nabla_t \rangle. \quad (15)$$

First, observe that for any primal-dual norm pair we have

$$\langle x_t - \hat{x}_t, \nabla_t - M_t \rangle \leq \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\| \|\nabla_t - M_t\|_*.$$

Any update of the form  $a^* = \arg \min_{a \in \mathcal{X}} \langle a, x \rangle + \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(a, c)$  satisfies for any  $d \in \mathcal{X}$ ,

$$\langle a^* - d, x \rangle \leq \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(d, c) - \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(d, a^*) - \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(a^*, c).$$

This entails

$$\langle x_t - \hat{x}_t, M_t \rangle \leq \frac{1}{\eta_t} \left\{ \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(\hat{x}_t, \hat{x}_{t-1}) - \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(\hat{x}_t, x_t) - \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(x_t, \hat{x}_{t-1}) \right\}$$

and

$$\langle \hat{x}_t - u_t, \nabla_t \rangle \leq \frac{1}{\eta_t} \left\{ \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_t, \hat{x}_{t-1}) - \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_t, \hat{x}_t) - \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(\hat{x}_t, \hat{x}_{t-1}) \right\}.$$

Combining the preceding relations and returning to (15), we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \langle x_t - u_t, \nabla_t \rangle &\leq \frac{1}{\eta_t} \left\{ \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_t, \hat{x}_{t-1}) - \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_t, \hat{x}_t) - \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(\hat{x}_t, x_t) - \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(x_t, \hat{x}_{t-1}) \right\} \\ &\quad + \|\nabla_t - M_t\|_* \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\| \\ &\leq \frac{1}{\eta_t} \left\{ \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_t, \hat{x}_{t-1}) - \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_t, \hat{x}_t) - \frac{1}{2} \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|^2 - \frac{1}{2} \|\hat{x}_{t-1} - x_t\|^2 \right\} \\ &\quad + \|\nabla_t - M_t\|_* \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|, \end{aligned} \quad (16)$$

where in the last step we appealed to strong convexity:  $\mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(x, y) \geq \frac{1}{2} \|x - y\|^2$  for any  $x, y \in \mathcal{X}$ . Using the simple inequality  $ab \leq \frac{\rho a^2}{2} + \frac{b^2}{2\rho}$  for any  $\rho > 0$  to split the product term, we get

$$\begin{aligned} \langle x_t - u_t, \nabla_t \rangle &\leq \frac{1}{\eta_t} \left\{ \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_t, \hat{x}_{t-1}) - \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_t, \hat{x}_t) - \frac{1}{2} \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|^2 - \frac{1}{2} \|\hat{x}_{t-1} - x_t\|^2 \right\} \\ &\quad + \frac{\eta_{t+1}}{2} \|\nabla_t - M_t\|_*^2 + \frac{1}{2\eta_{t+1}} \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|^2, \end{aligned}$$

Applying the bound

$$\frac{1}{2\eta_{t+1}} \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|^2 - \frac{1}{2\eta_t} \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|^2 \leq R_{\max}^2 \left( \frac{1}{\eta_{t+1}} - \frac{1}{\eta_t} \right),$$

and summing over  $t \in [T]$  yields ,

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{t=1}^T \langle x_t - u_t, \nabla_t \rangle &\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{\eta_{t+1}}{2} \|\nabla_t - M_t\|_*^2 + \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{1}{\eta_t} \left\{ \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_t, \hat{x}_{t-1}) - \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_t, \hat{x}_t) \right\} + \frac{R_{\max}^2}{\eta_{T+1}} \\
&\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{\eta_{t+1}}{2} \|\nabla_t - M_t\|_*^2 + R_{\max}^2 \left( \frac{1}{\eta_1} + \frac{1}{\eta_{T+1}} \right) \\
&\quad + \sum_{t=2}^T \left\{ \frac{\mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_t, \hat{x}_{t-1})}{\eta_t} - \frac{\mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_{t-1}, \hat{x}_{t-1})}{\eta_{t-1}} \right\} \\
&\leq \sum_{t=2}^T \left\{ \frac{\mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_t, \hat{x}_{t-1})}{\eta_t} - \frac{\mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_{t-1}, \hat{x}_{t-1})}{\eta_t} + \frac{\mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_{t-1}, \hat{x}_{t-1})}{\eta_t} - \frac{\mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_{t-1}, \hat{x}_{t-1})}{\eta_{t-1}} \right\} \\
&\quad + \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{\eta_{t+1}}{2} \|\nabla_t - M_t\|_*^2 + \frac{2R_{\max}^2}{\eta_{T+1}} \\
&\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{\eta_{t+1}}{2} \|\nabla_t - M_t\|_*^2 + \gamma \sum_{t=2}^T \frac{\|u_t - u_{t-1}\|}{\eta_t} \\
&\quad + \sum_{t=2}^T \mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(u_{t-1}, \hat{x}_{t-1}) \left( \frac{1}{\eta_t} - \frac{1}{\eta_{t-1}} \right) + \frac{2R_{\max}^2}{\eta_{T+1}} \\
&\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{\eta_{t+1}}{2} \|\nabla_t - M_t\|_*^2 + \gamma \sum_{t=2}^T \frac{\|u_t - u_{t-1}\|}{\eta_t} + \frac{4R_{\max}^2}{\eta_{T+1}} ,
\end{aligned}$$

where we used the Lipschitz continuity of  $\mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}$  in the penultimate step. Now let us set

$$\eta_t = \frac{L}{\sqrt{\sum_{s=0}^{t-1} \|\nabla_s - M_s\|_*^2} + \sqrt{\sum_{s=0}^{t-2} \|\nabla_s - M_s\|_*^2}} = \frac{L \left( \sqrt{\sum_{s=0}^{t-1} \|\nabla_s - M_s\|_*^2} - \sqrt{\sum_{s=0}^{t-2} \|\nabla_s - M_s\|_*^2} \right)}{\|\nabla_{t-1} - M_{t-1}\|_*^2},$$

and  $\|\nabla_0 - M_0\|_*^2 = 1$  to have

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{t=1}^T \langle x_t - u_t, \nabla_t \rangle &\leq \frac{L}{2} \sum_{t=1}^T \left\{ \sqrt{\sum_{s=0}^t \|\nabla_s - M_s\|_*^2} - \sqrt{\sum_{s=0}^{t-1} \|\nabla_s - M_s\|_*^2} \right\} \\
&\quad + \frac{2\gamma \sqrt{1 + \sum_{t=1}^T \|\nabla_t - M_t\|_*^2}}{L} \sum_{t=2}^T \|u_t - u_{t-1}\| + \frac{8R_{\max}^2 \sqrt{1 + \sum_{t=1}^T \|\nabla_t - M_t\|_*^2}}{L} \\
&\leq 2\sqrt{1 + \sum_{t=1}^T \|\nabla_t - M_t\|_*^2} \left( L + \frac{\gamma \sum_{t=1}^T \|u_t - u_{t-1}\| + 4R_{\max}^2}{L} \right) .
\end{aligned}$$

Appealing to convexity of  $\{f_t\}_{t=1}^T$ , and replacing  $C_T$  (3) and  $D_T$  (4) in above, completes the proof . ■

**Proof of Lemma 2.** We define

$$U_T \triangleq \left\{ u_1, \dots, u_T \in \mathcal{X} : \gamma \sum_{t=1}^T \|u_t - u_{t-1}\| \leq L^2 - 4R_{\max}^2 \right\}, \tag{17}$$

and

$$(u_1^*, \dots, u_T^*) \triangleq \operatorname{argmin}_{u_1, \dots, u_T \in U_T} \sum_{t=1}^T f_t(u_t).$$

Our choice of  $L > 2R_{\max}$  guarantees that any sequence of fixed comparators  $u_t = u$  for  $t \in [T]$  belongs to  $U_T$ , and hence,  $(u_1^*, \dots, u_T^*)$  exists. Noting that  $(u_1^*, \dots, u_T^*)$  is an element of  $U_T$ , we have  $\gamma \sum_{t=1}^T \|u_t^* - u_{t-1}^*\| + 4R_{\max}^2 \leq L^2$ . We now apply Lemma 1 to  $\{u_t^*\}_{t=1}^T$  to bound the dynamic regret for arbitrary comparator sequence  $\{u_t\}_{t=1}^T$  as follows,

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{Reg}_T^d(u_1, \dots, u_T) &= \sum_{t=1}^T \left\{ f_t(x_t) - f_t(u_t^*) \right\} + \sum_{t=1}^T \left\{ f_t(u_t^*) - f_t(u_t) \right\} \\ &\leq 4\sqrt{1 + D_T}L + \sum_{t=1}^T \left\{ f_t(u_t^*) - f_t(u_t) \right\} \\ &\leq 4\sqrt{1 + D_T}L + \mathbf{1} \left\{ \gamma \sum_{t=1}^T \|u_t - u_{t-1}\| > L^2 - 4R_{\max}^2 \right\} \left( \sum_{t=1}^T \left\{ f_t(u_t^*) - f_t(u_t) \right\} \right), \end{aligned} \quad (18)$$

where the last step follows from the fact that

$$\sum_{t=1}^T f_t(u_t^*) - \sum_{t=1}^T f_t(u_t) \leq 0 \quad \text{if } (u_1, \dots, u_T) \in U_T.$$

Given the definition of  $R_{\max}^2$ , by strong convexity of  $\mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}(x, y)$ , we get that  $\|x - y\| \leq \sqrt{2}R_{\max}$ , for any  $x, y \in \mathcal{X}$ . This entails that once we divide the horizon into  $B$  number of batches and use a single, fixed point as a comparator along each batch, we have

$$\sum_{t=1}^T \|u_t - u_{t-1}\| \leq B\sqrt{2}R_{\max}, \quad (19)$$

since there are at most  $B$  number of changes in the comparator sequence along the horizon. Now let  $B = \frac{L^2 - 4R_{\max}^2}{\gamma\sqrt{2}R_{\max}}$ , and for ease of notation, assume that  $T$  is divisible by  $B$ . Noting that  $f_t(x_t^*) \leq f_t(u_t)$ , we use an argument similar to that of [14] to get for any fixed  $t_i \in [(i-1)(T/B) + 1, i(T/B)]$ ,

$$\sum_{t=1}^T \left\{ f_t(u_t^*) - f_t(u_t) \right\} \leq \sum_{t=1}^T \left\{ f_t(u_t^*) - f_t(x_t^*) \right\} \quad (20)$$

$$\begin{aligned} &= \sum_{i=1}^B \sum_{t=(i-1)(T/B)+1}^{i(T/B)} \left\{ f_t(u_t^*) - f_t(x_t^*) \right\} \\ &\leq \sum_{i=1}^B \sum_{t=(i-1)(T/B)+1}^{i(T/B)} \left\{ f_t(x_{t_i}^*) - f_t(x_t^*) \right\} \end{aligned} \quad (21)$$

$$\leq \left( \frac{T}{B} \right) \sum_{i=1}^B \max_{t \in [(i-1)(T/B)+1, i(T/B)]} \left\{ f_t(x_{t_i}^*) - f_t(x_t^*) \right\}. \quad (22)$$

Note that  $x_{t_i}^*$  is fixed for each batch  $i$ . Substituting our choice of  $B = \frac{L^2 - 4R_{\max}^2}{\gamma\sqrt{2}R_{\max}}$  in (19) implies that the comparator sequence  $u_t = x_{t_i}^* \mathbf{1} \left\{ \frac{(i-1)T}{B} + 1 \leq t \leq \frac{iT}{B} \right\}$  belongs to  $U_T$ , and (21) follows by optimality of  $(u_1^*, \dots, u_T^*)$ . We now claim that for any  $t \in [(i-1)(T/B) + 1, i(T/B)]$ , we have,

$$f_t(x_{t_i}^*) - f_t(x_t^*) \leq 2 \sum_{s=(i-1)(T/B)+1}^{i(T/B)} \sup_{x \in \mathcal{X}} |f_s(x) - f_{s-1}(x)|. \quad (23)$$

Assuming otherwise, there must exist a  $\hat{t}_i \in [(i-1)(T/B) + 1, i(T/B)]$  such that

$$f_{\hat{t}_i}(x_{\hat{t}_i}^*) - f_{\hat{t}_i}(x_{\hat{t}_i}^*) > 2 \sum_{t=(i-1)(T/B)+1}^{i(T/B)} \sup_{x \in \mathcal{X}} |f_t(x) - f_{t-1}(x)|,$$

which results in

$$\begin{aligned} f_t(x_{\hat{t}_i}^*) &\leq f_{\hat{t}_i}(x_{\hat{t}_i}^*) + \sum_{t=(i-1)(T/B)+1}^{i(T/B)} \sup_{x \in \mathcal{X}} |f_t(x) - f_{t-1}(x)| \\ &< f_{\hat{t}_i}(x_{\hat{t}_i}^*) - \sum_{t=(i-1)(T/B)+1}^{i(T/B)} \sup_{x \in \mathcal{X}} |f_t(x) - f_{t-1}(x)| \leq f_t(x_{\hat{t}_i}^*), \end{aligned}$$

The preceding relation for  $t = t_i$  violates the optimality of  $x_{t_i}^*$ , which is a contradiction. Therefore, Equation (23) holds for any  $t \in [(i-1)(T/B) + 1, i(T/B)]$ . Combining (20), (22) and (23) we have

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{t=1}^T \left\{ f_t(u_t^*) - f_t(u_t) \right\} &\leq \frac{2T}{B} \sum_{i=1}^B \sum_{t=(i-1)(T/B)+1}^{i(T/B)} \sup_{x \in \mathcal{X}} |f_t(x) - f_{t-1}(x)| \\ &= \frac{2TV_T}{B} = \frac{2\gamma\sqrt{2}R_{\max}TV_T}{L^2 - 4R_{\max}^2}. \end{aligned} \quad (24)$$

Using the above in Equation (18) we conclude the following upper bound

$$\mathbf{Reg}_T^d(u_1, \dots, u_T) \leq 4\sqrt{1 + D_T}L + \mathbf{1} \left\{ \gamma \sum_{t=1}^T \|u_t - u_{t-1}\| > L^2 - 4R_{\max}^2 \right\} \frac{4\gamma R_{\max}TV_T}{L^2 - 4R_{\max}^2},$$

thereby completing the proof. ■

**Proof of Proposition 5.** Assume that the player I uses the prescribed strategy. This corresponds to using the optimistic mirror descent update with  $\mathcal{R}(x) = \sum_{i=1}^n x_i \log(x_i)$  as the function that is strongly convex w.r.t.  $\|\cdot\|_1$ . Correspondingly,  $\nabla_t = f_t^\top A_t$  and  $M_t = f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}$ . Following the line of proof in Lemma 1, in particular, using Equation 16 for the specific case with  $\mathcal{D}_{\mathcal{R}}$  as KL divergence, we get that for any  $t$  and any  $u_t \in \Delta_n$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} f_t^\top A_t x_t - f_t^\top A_t u_t &\leq \frac{1}{\eta_t} \left\{ \sum_{i=1}^n u_t[i] \log \left( \frac{\hat{x}_t[i]}{\hat{x}'_{t-1}[i]} \right) - \frac{1}{2} \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 - \frac{1}{2} \|\hat{x}'_{t-1} - x_t\|_1^2 \right\} \\ &\quad + \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|_1 \\ &\leq \frac{1}{\eta_t} \left\{ \sum_{i=1}^n u_t[i] \log \left( \frac{\hat{x}'_t[i]}{\hat{x}'_{t-1}[i]} \right) - \frac{1}{2} \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 - \frac{1}{2} \|\hat{x}'_{t-1} - x_t\|_1^2 \right\} \\ &\quad + \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|_1 + \frac{1}{\eta_t} \max_{i \in [n]} \log \left( \frac{\hat{x}_t[i]}{\hat{x}'_t[i]} \right). \end{aligned}$$

Now let us bound for some  $i$  the term,  $\log \left( \frac{\hat{x}_t[i]}{\hat{x}'_t[i]} \right)$ . Notice that if  $\hat{x}_t[i] \leq \hat{x}'_t[i]$  then the term is anyway bounded by 0. Now assume  $\hat{x}_t[i] > \hat{x}'_t[i]$ . Letting  $\beta = 1/T^2$ , since  $\hat{x}'_t[i] = (1 - T^{-2})\hat{x}_t[i] + 1/(nT^2)$ , we can have  $\hat{x}_t[i] > \hat{x}'_t[i]$  only when  $\hat{x}_t[i] > 1/n$ . Hence,

$$\log \left( \frac{\hat{x}_t[i]}{\hat{x}'_t[i]} \right) = \log \left( \frac{\hat{x}_t[i]}{(1 - T^{-2})\hat{x}_t[i] + 1/(nT^2)} \right) \leq \frac{2}{T^2}.$$

Using this we can conclude that :

$$f_t^\top A_t x_t - f_t^\top A_t u_t \leq \frac{1}{\eta_t} \left\{ \sum_{i=1}^n u_t[i] \log \left( \frac{\hat{x}'_t[i]}{\hat{x}'_{t-1}[i]} \right) - \frac{1}{2} \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 - \frac{1}{2} \|\hat{x}'_{t-1} - x_t\|_1^2 \right\} \\ + \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|_1 + \frac{2}{T^2} \frac{1}{\eta_t}.$$

Summing over  $t \in [T]$  we obtain that :

$$\sum_{t=1}^T (f_t^\top A_t x_t - f_t^\top A_t u_t) \leq \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{1}{\eta_t} \left\{ \sum_{i=1}^n u_t[i] \log \left( \frac{\hat{x}'_t[i]}{\hat{x}'_{t-1}[i]} \right) - \frac{1}{2} \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 - \frac{1}{2} \|\hat{x}'_{t-1} - x_t\|_1^2 \right\} \\ + \sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|_1 + \frac{2}{T^2} \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{1}{\eta_t}.$$

Note that  $\frac{1}{\eta_t} \leq \mathcal{O}(\sqrt{T})$  and so assuming  $T$  is large enough,  $\frac{1}{T^2} \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{1}{\eta_t} \leq 1$  and so,

$$\sum_{t=1}^T (f_t^\top A_t x_t - f_t^\top A_t u_t) \leq \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{1}{\eta_t} \left\{ \sum_{i=1}^n u_t[i] \log \left( \frac{\hat{x}'_t[i]}{\hat{x}'_{t-1}[i]} \right) - \frac{1}{2} \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 - \frac{1}{2} \|\hat{x}'_{t-1} - x_t\|_1^2 \right\} \\ + \sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|_1 + 1. \quad (25)$$

Now note that we can rewrite the first sum in the above bound and get :

$$\sum_{t=1}^T \frac{1}{\eta_t} \sum_{i=1}^n u_t[i] \log \left( \frac{\hat{x}'_t[i]}{\hat{x}'_{t-1}[i]} \right) \leq \sum_{t=2}^T \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n u_t[i] \log \left( \frac{1}{\hat{x}'_{t-1}[i]} \right) - \sum_{i=1}^n u_{t-1}[i] \log \left( \frac{1}{\hat{x}'_{t-1}[i]} \right)}{\eta_t} + \frac{\log(T^2 n)}{\eta_1} \\ \leq \sum_{t=2}^T \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n (u_t[i] - u_{t-1}[i]) \log \left( \frac{1}{\hat{x}'_{t-1}[i]} \right)}{\eta_t} \\ + \sum_{t=2}^T \sum_{i=1}^n u_{t-1}[i] \log \left( \frac{1}{\hat{x}'_{t-1}[i]} \right) \left( \frac{1}{\eta_t} - \frac{1}{\eta_{t-1}} \right) + \frac{\log(T^2 n)}{\eta_1}.$$

Since by definition of  $\hat{x}'_{t-1}$ , we are mixing in  $1/T^2$  of the uniform distribution we have that for any  $i$ ,  $\hat{x}'_{t-1}[i] > \frac{1}{T^2 n}$  and, since  $\eta_t$ 's are non-increasing, we continue bounding above as

$$\sum_{t=1}^T \frac{1}{\eta_t} \sum_{i=1}^n u_t[i] \log \left( \frac{\hat{x}'_t[i]}{\hat{x}'_{t-1}[i]} \right) \leq \log(T^2 n) \sum_{t=2}^T \frac{\|u_{t-1} - u_t\|_1}{\eta_t} + \log(T^2 n) \sum_{t=2}^T \left( \frac{1}{\eta_t} - \frac{1}{\eta_{t-1}} \right) + \frac{\log(T^2 n)}{\eta_1} \\ \leq \log(T^2 n) \left( \sum_{t=2}^T \frac{\|u_{t-1} - u_t\|_1}{\eta_t} + \frac{1}{\eta_T} - \frac{1}{\eta_1} \right) + \frac{\log(T^2 n)}{\eta_1} \\ \leq \log(T^2 n) \left( \sum_{t=2}^T \frac{\|u_{t-1} - u_t\|_1}{\eta_t} + \frac{1}{\eta_T} \right),$$

using the above in Equation 25 we get

$$\begin{aligned}
& \sum_{t=1}^T f_t^\top A_t x_t - f_t^\top A_t u_t \\
& \leq \log(T^2 n) \sum_{t=2}^T \frac{\|u_{t-1} - u_t\|_1}{\eta_t} - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{1}{\eta_t} \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{1}{\eta_t} \|\hat{x}'_{t-1} - x_t\|_1^2 + 1 \\
& \quad + \sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|_1 + \frac{\log(T^2 n)}{\eta_T} \\
& \leq \frac{\log(T^2 n) (C_T(u_1, \dots, u_T) + 2)}{\eta_T} - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{1}{\eta_t} \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{1}{\eta_t} \|\hat{x}'_{t-1} - x_t\|_1^2 \\
& \quad + \sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|_1. \tag{26}
\end{aligned}$$

Notice that our choice of step size given by,

$$\begin{aligned}
\eta_t &= \min \left\{ \log(T^2 n) \frac{L}{\sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^{t-1} \|f_i^\top A_i - f_{i-1}^\top A_{i-1}\|_\infty^2} + \sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^{t-2} \|f_i^\top A_i - f_{i-1}^\top A_{i-1}\|_\infty^2}}, \frac{1}{32L} \right\} \\
&= \min \left\{ \log(T^2 n) \frac{L \left( \sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^{t-1} \|f_i^\top A_i - f_{i-1}^\top A_{i-1}\|_\infty^2} - \sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^{t-2} \|f_i^\top A_i - f_{i-1}^\top A_{i-1}\|_\infty^2} \right)}{\|f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1} - f_{t-2}^\top A_{t-2}\|_\infty^2}, \frac{1}{32L} \right\}, \tag{27}
\end{aligned}$$

guarantees that

$$\eta_t^{-1} = \max \left\{ \frac{\sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^{t-1} \|f_i^\top A_i - f_{i-1}^\top A_{i-1}\|_\infty^2} + \sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^{t-2} \|f_i^\top A_i - f_{i-1}^\top A_{i-1}\|_\infty^2}}{\log(T^2 n) L}, 32L \right\}.$$

Using the step-size specified above in the bound 26, we get

$$\begin{aligned}
& \sum_{t=1}^T f_t^\top A_t x_t - \sum_{t=1}^T f_t^\top A_t u_t \\
& \leq \log(T^2 n) (C_T(u_1, \dots, u_T) + 2) \left( \frac{2\sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty^2}}{\log(T^2 n) L} + 32L \right) \\
& \quad + \sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|_1 - 16L \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 - 16L \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{x}'_{t-1} - x_t\|_1^2. \tag{28}
\end{aligned}$$

Now note that by triangle inequality, we have

$$\begin{aligned}
\|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty &= \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1} + f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1} - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty \\
&\leq \|A_{t-1} - A_t\|_\infty + \|f_t - f_{t-1}\|_1 \\
&\leq \|A_{t-1} - A_t\|_\infty + \|f_t - \hat{f}_{t-1}\|_1 + \|\hat{f}_{t-1} - f_{t-1}\|_1,
\end{aligned}$$

since the entries of matrix sequence  $\{A_t\}_{t=1}^T$  are bounded by one. Using the bound above in (28) and splitting the

product term, we see that

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{t=1}^T \left( f_t^\top A_t x_t - f_t^\top A_t u_t \right) &\leq \log(T^2 n) (C_T(u_1, \dots, u_T) + 2) \left( \frac{2\sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty^2}}{\log(T^2 n)L} + 32L \right) \\
&\quad + 2 \sum_{t=1}^T \|A_t - A_{t-1}\|_\infty - 8L \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 - 16L \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{x}'_{t-1} - x_t\|_1^2 \\
&\quad + \frac{1}{16L} \sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t - \hat{f}_{t-1}\|_1^2 + \frac{1}{16L} \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}_{t-1} - f_{t-1}\|_1^2, \tag{29}
\end{aligned}$$

where we used the simple inequality  $ab \leq \frac{\rho}{2}a^2 + \frac{1}{2\rho}b^2$  for  $\rho > 0$ .

a) *When Player II follows prescribed strategy:* In this case we would like to get convergence of payoffs to the average value of the games. To get this, using the notation  $x_t^* = \operatorname{argmin}_{x_t \in \Delta_n} f_t^\top A_t x_t$  and denoting the corresponding sequence regularity for Player I by  $C_T$ , we get

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{t=1}^T \left( f_t^\top A_t x_t - f_t^\top A_t x_t^* \right) &\leq \log(T^2 n) (C_T + 2) \left( \frac{2\sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty^2}}{\log(T^2 n)L} + 32L \right) \\
&\quad + 2 \sum_{t=1}^T \|A_t - A_{t-1}\|_\infty - 8L \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 - 16L \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{x}'_{t-1} - x_t\|_1^2 \\
&\quad + \frac{1}{16L} \sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t - \hat{f}_{t-1}\|_1^2 + \frac{1}{16L} \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}_t - f_t\|_1^2 + \frac{1}{4L},
\end{aligned}$$

where the term  $\frac{1}{4L}$  appeared in the last line comparing to (29) is due to

$$\frac{1}{16L} \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}_{t-1} - f_{t-1}\|_1^2 - \frac{1}{16L} \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}_t - f_t\|_1^2 \leq \frac{1}{4L}.$$

Using the same bound for Player 2 (using loss as  $-f_t^\top A_t x_t$  on round  $t$ ), as well as using  $f_t^* = \operatorname{argmin}_{f_t \in \Delta_m} -f_t^\top A_t x_t$  and denoting the corresponding sequence regularity by  $C'_T$ , we have that

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{t=1}^T \left( f_t^\top A_t x_t - f_t^{*\top} A_t x_t \right) &\geq -\log(T^2 m) (C'_T + 2) \left( \frac{2\sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|A_t x_t - A_{t-1} x_{t-1}\|_\infty^2}}{\log(T^2 m)L} + 32L \right) \\
&\quad - 2 \sum_{t=1}^T \|A_t - A_{t-1}\|_\infty + 8L \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}_t - f_t\|_1^2 + 16L \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}'_{t-1} - f_t\|_1^2 \\
&\quad - \frac{1}{16L} \sum_{t=1}^T \|x_t - \hat{x}_{t-1}\|_1^2 - \frac{1}{16L} \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 - \frac{1}{4L}.
\end{aligned}$$

Combining the two and noting that

$$\begin{aligned}
f_t^{*\top} A_t x_t &= \sup_{f_t \in \Delta_m} f_t^\top A_t x_t \geq \inf_{x_t \in \Delta_n} \sup_{f_t \in \Delta_m} f_t^\top A_t x_t \\
&= \sup_{f_t \in \Delta_m} \inf_{x_t \in \Delta_n} f_t^\top A_t x_t \geq \inf_{x_t \in \Delta_n} f_t^\top A_t x_t = f_t^\top A_t x_t^*,
\end{aligned}$$

we get

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{t=1}^T \sup_{f_t \in \Delta_m} f_t^\top A_t x_t &\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \inf_{x_t \in \Delta_n} \sup_{f_t \in \Delta_m} f_t^\top A_t x_t + \frac{256L}{T} + \frac{1}{2L} + 4 \sum_{t=1}^T \|A_t - A_{t-1}\|_\infty \\
&\quad + \log(T^2 n) (C_T + 2) \left( \frac{2\sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty^2}}{\log(T^2 n)L} + 32L \right) \\
&\quad + \log(T^2 m) (C'_T + 2) \left( \frac{2\sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|A_t x_t - A_{t-1} x_{t-1}\|_\infty^2}}{\log(T^2 m)L} + 32L \right) \\
&\quad + \left( \frac{1}{16L} - 8L \right) \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 + \left( \frac{1}{16L} - 16L \right) \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{x}_{t-1} - x_{t-1}\|_1^2 \\
&\quad + \left( \frac{1}{16L} - 8L \right) \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}_t - f_t\|_1^2 + \left( \frac{1}{16L} - 16L \right) \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}_{t-1} - f_{t-1}\|_1^2, \tag{30}
\end{aligned}$$

where the constant  $256L/T$  appeared in the first line accounts for the identities

$$\|\hat{x}_{t-1} - x_{t-1}\|_1^2 - \|\hat{x}'_{t-1} - x_{t-1}\|_1^2 \leq \frac{8}{T^2} \quad \|\hat{f}_{t-1} - f_{t-1}\|_1^2 - \|\hat{f}'_{t-1} - f_{t-1}\|_1^2 \leq \frac{8}{T^2}.$$

Using the triangle inequality again,

$$\begin{aligned}
\sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty^2 &= \sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_t^\top A_{t-1} + f_t^\top A_{t-1} - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty^2 \\
&\leq 2 \sum_{t=1}^T \|A_{t-1} - A_t\|_\infty^2 + 2 \sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t - f_{t-1}\|_1^2 \\
&\leq 2 \sum_{t=1}^T \|A_{t-1} - A_t\|_\infty^2 + 4 \sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t - \hat{f}_{t-1}\|_1^2 + 4 \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}_{t-1} - f_{t-1}\|_1^2, \tag{31}
\end{aligned}$$

which also implies

$$\begin{aligned}
\sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty^2} &\leq \sqrt{2 \sum_{t=1}^T \|A_{t-1} - A_t\|_\infty^2 + 4 \sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t - \hat{f}_{t-1}\|_1^2 + 4 \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}_{t-1} - f_{t-1}\|_1^2} \\
&\leq 2\sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|A_{t-1} - A_t\|_\infty^2} + 2\sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t - \hat{f}_{t-1}\|_1^2 + \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}_{t-1} - f_{t-1}\|_1^2} \\
&\leq 2\sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|A_{t-1} - A_t\|_\infty^2} + 2 + 2\sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t - \hat{f}_{t-1}\|_1 + 2\sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}_{t-1} - f_{t-1}\|_1 \\
&\leq 2\sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|A_{t-1} - A_t\|_\infty^2} + 10 + 2\sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t - \hat{f}_{t-1}\|_1 + 2\sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}_{t-1} - f_{t-1}\|_1, \tag{32}
\end{aligned}$$



where we used the bound  $\sqrt{c} \leq c + 1$  for any  $c \geq 0$  in the penultimate line. Similar bounds as Equations (31) and (32) hold for the other player as well. Using them in Equation 30 after some calculations, we conclude that

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{t=1}^T \sup_{f_t \in \Delta_m} f_t^\top A_t x_t &\leq \sum_{t=1}^T \inf_{x_t \in \Delta_n} \sup_{f_t \in \Delta_m} f_t^\top A_t x_t + \frac{256L}{T} + \frac{1}{2L} + 4 \sum_{t=1}^T \|A_{t-1} - A_t\|_\infty \\ &+ 32L(\log(T^2 n)C_T + \log(T^2 m)C'_T + 2\log(T^4 nm)) + (C_T + C'_T + 4) \frac{20 + 4\sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|A_{t-1} - A_t\|_\infty^2}}{L} \\ &+ 4 \left( \frac{C_T + 3}{L} - 2L \right) \left( \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}_t - f_t\|_1^2 + 2 \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{f}_{t-1} - f_t\|_1^2 \right) \\ &+ 4 \left( \frac{C'_T + 3}{L} - 2L \right) \left( \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 + 2 \sum_{t=1}^T \|\hat{x}_{t-1} - x_t\|_1^2 \right). \end{aligned}$$

b) *When Player II is dishonest:* In this case we would like to bound Player I's regret regardless of the strategy adopted by Player II. Dropping one of the negative terms in Equation 26, we get :

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{t=1}^T (f_t^\top A_t x_t - f_t^\top A_t u_t) &\leq \frac{\log(T^2 n)(C_T(u_1, \dots, u_T) + 2)}{\eta_T} - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{1}{\eta_t} \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 \\ &+ \sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|_1 \\ &\leq \frac{\log(T^2 n)(C_T(u_1, \dots, u_T) + 2)}{\eta_T} - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{1}{\eta_t} \|\hat{x}_t - x_t\|_1^2 \\ &+ \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{\eta_{t+1}}{2} \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty^2 + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{1}{\eta_{t+1}} \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|_1^2. \end{aligned} \quad (33)$$

Noting to the telescoping sum

$$\frac{1}{2} \sum_{t=1}^T \left( \frac{1}{\eta_{t+1}} - \frac{1}{\eta_t} \right) \|x_t - \hat{x}_t\|_1^2 \leq 2 \sum_{t=1}^T \left( \frac{1}{\eta_{t+1}} - \frac{1}{\eta_t} \right) \leq \frac{2}{\eta_{T+1}},$$

as well as the choice of step-size (27) which entails

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{t=1}^T \frac{\eta_{t+1}}{2} \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty^2 &\leq \log(T^2 n) \frac{L}{2} \sum_{t=1}^T \sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^t \|f_i^\top A_i - f_{i-1}^\top A_{i-1}\|_\infty^2} - \sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^{t-1} \|f_i^\top A_i - f_{i-1}^\top A_{i-1}\|_\infty^2} \\ &\leq \log(T^2 n) \frac{L}{2} \sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty^2}, \end{aligned}$$

we bound (33) to obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{t=1}^T (f_t^\top A_t x_t - f_t^\top A_t u_t) &\leq \frac{\log(T^2 n)(C_T(u_1, \dots, u_T) + 2)}{\eta_T} + \frac{2}{\eta_{T+1}} + \log(T^2 n) \frac{L}{2} \sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty^2} \\ &\leq 2 \log(T^2 n)(C_T(u_1, \dots, u_T) + 2) \left( 32L + \frac{2\sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty^2}}{\log(T^2 n)L} \right) \\ &+ \log(T^2 n) \frac{L}{2} \sqrt{\sum_{t=1}^T \|f_t^\top A_t - f_{t-1}^\top A_{t-1}\|_\infty^2}. \end{aligned}$$

A similar statement holds for Player II that her/his pay off converges at the provided rate to the average minimax equilibrium value. ■